OPERATIONAL AUDIT

OKLAHOMA ÅERONAUTICS COMMISSION CITY OF SHAWNEE — PROJECT NUMBER SNL-10-S CONSTRUCTION OF NEW TERMINAL BUILDING

For the period March 4, 2010 through September 9, 2013





Oklahoma State Auditor & Inspector Gary A. Jones, CPA, CFE

Audit Report of the Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission City of Shawnee - Project Number SNL-10-S Construction of New Terminal Building

For the Period March 4, 2010 through September 9, 2013

Oklahoma State Auditor & Inspector

2300 N. Lincoln Blvd. • State Capitol, Room 100 • Oklahoma City, OK 73105 • Phone: 405.521.3495 • Fax: 405.521.3426

October 9, 2013

TO THE OKLAHOMA AERONAUTICS COMMISSION

At management's request, we have conducted an audit of the Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission (Commission) – City of Shawnee (state project number SNL-10-S) for the period March 4, 2010 through September 9, 2013. The objective of the audit was to determine whether expenditures paid to the City of Shawnee were in accordance with *Exhibit B-1 – Program Narrative* and *Exhibit B-2 – Project Costs* of the airport construction agreement.

According to Exhibit B-1 and Exhibit B-2, the project was to provide a new terminal building. The project was budgeted at \$965,645. The Commission's share of the budget was \$275,000 and the City of Shawnee's share was \$690,645.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

Our audit procedures included inquiries of appropriate Commission personnel, the project engineer, the project architect, the Shawnee Finance Director, and the current and former assistant airport managers; inspection of all invoices and supporting documentation related to project reimbursements; and a physical inspection of the completed project conducted on October 7, 2013. **These procedures indicated that costs paid to the City of Shawnee by the Commission appeared to be in accordance with the** *Program Narrative* and the *Project Costs*.

This report is a public document pursuant to the Oklahoma Open Records Act (51 O.S. § 24A.1 et seq.), and shall be open to any person for inspection and copying.

Sincerely,

GARY A. JONES, CPA, CFE

Say af

OKLAHOMA STATE AUDITOR & INSPECTOR



Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission Operational Audit Appendix- Project Costs (unaudited) and Close Out Documentation

The following information has been presented at the request of management. Therefore, we did not verify the data presented in the following schedules.

Category	Budget	Cha	nge Order*	Adj	usted Budget	Actual	7	ariance
Construction	\$ 965,645.00	\$	(20,058.00)	\$	945,587.00	\$ 951,037.00	\$	(5,450.00)
Project Cost	\$ 965,645.00			\$	945,587.00	\$ 951,037.00	\$	(5,450.00)

	1	Budget Amount	Budget Amount Including ange Orders		Actual	`	/ariance
City's Share (71.5%)	\$	690,645.00	\$ 676,283.82	\$	680,197.83	\$	(3,914.01)
Commission's Share (28.5%)		275,000.00	 269,303.18		270,839.17		(1,535.99)
	\$	965,645.00	\$ 945,587.00	\$	951,037.00	\$	(5,450.00)

^{*}Since the change order amount is reflected in the adjusted budget amount, the construction variance on this schedule differs from the construction variance presented on page A-2 ((20,058) + 14,608 = (5,450)).

Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission Operational Audit Appendix- Project Costs (unaudited) and Close Out Documentation

Line NO.	Description	Bid Amount	A	ctual Cost	Cost Variance
1	Mobilization	\$ 27,465	\$	27,465	\$ -
2	Sitework/Demolition	46,085		46,085	-
3	Fencing	25,547		25,547	-
4	Lawn & Grasses	1,080		1,080	-
5	Exterior Concrete/Asphalt	38,793		38,793	-
6	Dirtwork	10,268		10,268	-
7	Formwork	11,183		11,183	-
8	Reinforcing	10,610		10,610	-
9	Concrete	31,999		31,999	-
10	Artificial Stone	31,443		31,443	_
11	Structural Steel	53,090		53,090	-
12	Rough Carpentry/Wood Trusses	66,095		71,545	(5,450)
13	Millwork	18,171		18,171	-
14	Modified Bituminous Roof	4,000		4,000	-
15	Standing Seam Roof/Siding	65,360		65,360	-
16	Joint Sealants	3,943		3,943	-
17	Hollow Metal	3,994		3,994	-
18	Wood Doors	5,255		5,255	-
19	Aluminum Store Front & Doors	124,186		124,186	-
20	Door Hardware	9,760		9,760	-
21	Drywall & Acoustical	59,272		59,272	-
22	Floor & Wall Covering	30,475		30,475	-
23	Painting	16,500		16,500	-
24	Toilet partitions	3,778		3,778	-
25	Signage	4,853		4,853	-
26	Fire Extuinguishers	1,705		1,705	-
27	Toilet Accessories/Access Panels	5,708		5,708	-
28	Roller Shades	1,960		1,960	-
29	Plumbing	69,727		69,727	-
30	HVAC	78,050		78,050	-
31	Electrical	105,290		105,290	-
32	Change Order 1	 		(20,058.00)	20,058
	Subtotal for Base Bid	\$ 965,645.00	\$	951,037.00	\$ 14,608.00

NOTICE OF FINAL INSPECTION

	Date:	5-24-11
	Project Number:	
	Airport:	Shawnee Regional
TO:	Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1244 W Oklahoma City OK 73102 (405) 604-6900 – phone (405) 604-6919 – fax	
FROM;	Rex Hennen Assistant Airport Manager P.O. Box 1448 Address	
	Shawnee 74802 City/Town and Zip Code	
	405-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number	
This is to adv	rise you that the above referenced pr	oject is complete and ready for
inspection.	The final inspection is scheduled to be	egin at 1:00 P.M. (Time)
on June 1,	2011 at Shawne	e Regional Terminal . (Location)
there to be	ing this request, I have carefully gon no known plan omissions and the lose conformity with approved plans	nat the work is complete and in
Signature of above	As named person	Assistant Airport Manager

FINAL INSPECTION REPORT

	1-2011, Project No: SNL-10	
O:	Oklahoma Aeronautics C 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1 Oklahoma City OK 73102 (405) 604-6900 – phone (405) 604-6919 – fax	244 W
FROM:	Rex Hennen Assistant Airport Manager	
	P.O. Box 1448 Address	
	Shawnee 74802 City/Town and Zip Code	
	Out to the same and a same a	
on <u>June 1</u>	Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawne (Location	(Assistant Airport Manager)
on <u>June 1</u> Date) Personnel a	Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawne (Location attending inspection:	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional
on <u>June 1</u> Date) Personnel a	Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawne (Location attending inspection:	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional name-title-organization
on <u>June 1</u> Date) Personnel a	A05-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawned (Location attending inspection: name-title-organization attending inspection)	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional
Personnel a	Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawne (Location attending inspection: name-title-organization en	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional name-title-organization City of Shawnee
Personnel a	A05-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawm (Localion attending inspection: name-title-organization en	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional name-title-organization City of Shawnee LBR
Personnel a Rex Henn Jed Banks	A05-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawner (Location attending inspection: name-title-organization en	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional name-title-organization City of Shawnee LBR B & B
Personnel a Rex Henn Jed Banks Fred Sean Todd Gilbe Duane Ma	A05-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was 2011 at Shawner (Location attending inspection: name-title-organization en	(Assistant Airport Manager) eeRegional name-title-organization City of Shawnee LBR B & B B & B Mass Architects

Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission Operational Audit Appendix- Project Costs (unaudited) and Close Out Documentation

Anticipated completion date for above	exceptions: July 15, 2011
he medo	
MARIE	ASSISTINT AIRPOT MANAGER



Shawnee, Oklahoma

Duane D Mass AIA
June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning

Dis	scipline Code:				
1,,	Floors & Base	5.	Doors	9.	Mechanical
2.	Walls (NSEW)	6.	Windows	10.	Electrical
3	Ceiling	7	Specialties	11,	Communications
4.	Millwork	8.	Misc	12	Lighting

The following punch list is the result of an inspection of project areas of the project by Mass Architects, Inc. conducted Wednesday, June 1, 2011. The purpose of this inspection was to confirm the work is in accordance with the Contract Documents and identify items in need of repair/correction. Exclusion of any and all items mentioned herein does not alleviate the Contractor from those requirements set forth in the Contract Documents.

The Contractor shall notify the Architect, in writing, upon completion of all items for final inspection. The Contractor estimates final completion in 45 days, on or about July 15, 2011

General Items

item	code	description	responsible	complete
.01	1,2,6	Conduct Cleaning in accordance with Spec Section 01710	358	~
.02	8	Complete building demolition (existing terminal) upon relocation of owner to new Terminal	8 18	~
.03	1	Finish base in all areas, finish reducer strip at carpet all areas	B { B	V
.04	8	Finish sod and final dirtwork around terminal	BiB	v
.05	8	Coordinate new gas meter with ONG per ONG's request to relocate meter	AIRPORT	vi
.06	6	Clean all glass & remove adhesive and splashed concrete residue	BiB	v
.07	6	Align mull covers on storefront 4 locations, align horizontal mullions.	Вів	~

Building Exterior SW

item code description responsible complete

SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008

Shawnee, Oklahoma

Duane D Mass AIA June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning Discipline Code: 5. Doors Floors & Base 9. Mechanical 2 Walls (NSEW) 6 Windows 10 Electrical 3. Ceiling 11. Communications 7 Specialties 4. Millwork 8. Misc 12. Lighting Clean caulk joint out and re-caulk @ beam cover to column cover BiB Clean glass and metal trim of residue .02 BBB

Building Exterior West Wall

item	code	description	responsible	complete
.01	12	Above canopy trim EIFS edge on south side, and caulk exposed edges	B 1 B	V
.02	2	Caulk off support knuckles of canopy to EIFS with backer-rod	BiB	ν,
.03	2	Paint support rods of canopy	BBB	V
.04	6	Adjust horizontal mulfions to align	BiB	~
.05	2	Clean EIFS finish coat off rock and mortar typical	BiB	V
.06	10	Clean sconce lighting	3 5 8	V
.07	6	Clean glass typical	13 43	V
.08	6	Clean aluminum mullions of sealant and dirt/debns	BGB	r
.09	6	2 horiz mullion covers out ¼" short	BiB	-
.10	6	Clean column covers NW	BiB	V

punch list.

A-7

SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008

Shawnee, Oklahoma

Duane D Mass AiA

June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning

Discipline Code:

Discipline Code:
1 Floors & Base
2 Walls (NSEW) 5. Doors 9 Mechanical
6. Windows 10 Electrical
7. Specialties 11. Communications
8. Misc 12 Lightica 3. Ceiling

4. Millwork

Building Exterior North Wall

item	code	description	responsible	omplete
.01	2	Clean EIFS off Rock	Вів	~
.02	2	Clean rock of excess mortar	838	V
.03	2	Fill void at Rock, EIFS, metal band intersection	838	v
.04	2	Clean Caulk off metal panel under soffitt	ВЗВ	V

Building Exterior East Wall

item	code	description	responsible	complete
.01	2	Clean galls mullions typical	8 / 8	~
.02	2	Clean EIFS off rock	BiB	~
.03	2 Ali	Clean excess mortar off rock	318	V
.04	2	Seal broken mortar to rock	BiB	V
.05	2	Seal wall hydrant to rock	BiB	V
.06	1	Touch up morter to loose @ base of rock	BiB	r

Building Exterior Wall South

item code Description: responsible complete the commence of the commence o punch list.

SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008

Shawnee, Oklahoma

Duane D Mass AIA

June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning

Dis	cipline Cod	8				
1	Floors & B	ase	5.	Doors	9.	Mechanical
2.	2. Walls (NSEW)		Windows	10	Electrical	
3.	Cerling		7.	Specialties	11.	Communications
4	Millwork		8.	Misc	12.	Lighting
.0	1 8	Clean out mecha	Clean out mechanical court area			338
.0	2 2	Clean rough EIF	S fi	nish at cap of wing wall	-	B 5 B
.0.	3 2	Open mortar join	£ 18	3° east of glass		BiB
.0.	4 8	Clean sealant of	me	etal trim	204 200	

			15	- 5	0	-
.04	8	Clean sealant off metal trim	13	è	8	~
.05	8	Clean glass and mullions typical of debris and sealant	B	3	3	v
.06	2	Touch up mortar at entry		Ġ		·
.07	2	Caulk soffit to rock where missing mortar at entry	B	4	3	-
L.	1					column as were an

Interior at Entry

item	code	Description	. 1	res	рог	sibi	6 .0	omp	lete
.01	12	Caulk and touch up paint at FA notifier cabinet	-	3	5	В	1	r	
.02	1	Finish base	2	B	3	B	-	V	
.03	10	Finish installing lighting lenses	d.	В	ŝ	в		V	1

Terminal Area

item	cod	e d	escription	on .		responsible	complete
.01	. 8	Fi	nish guss	et plate covers a	t trusses	838	ν
.02	10	FI	oor outlet	covers - all		BiB	v
	Si .	4	2	ï		punch	list.

SUBSTANTIAL COMPLETION PUNCH LIST SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008 Shawnee, Oklahoma Duane D Mass AIA June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning Discipline Code: Floors & Base 5. Doors Mechanical 2. Walls (NSEW) 10. Electrical Windows 3. Ceiling Specialties Communications 11. Millwork 8. Misc 12. Lighting Touch up wall @ 9' west end of vestibule .03 2 B5 B Clean multion covers .04 350 Reducer strips and finish base .05 Close off high corner at wood beam covers with .06 metal or wood BSB Repair wall at damage above entry of toilet areas .07 B 3 B Check tile for paint splatters typical .08 BSB Men's Room code description responsible complete Clean grout off tile @ floor by door - men's .01 310 Finish dusting and cleaning walls - men's .02 .03 Finish cleaning -- women's BSB **FBO Counter** code description responsible complete .01 Putty Nail holes at wood trim typical all areas, use color match putty .02 Clean area - still dirty/dusty

punch list.

85B

punch list.

SUBSTANTIAL COMPLETION PUNCH LIST SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008 Shawnee, Oklahoma Duane D Mass AiA June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning Discipline Code: 1. Floors & Base Doors 9. Mechanical Walls (NSEW) 6. Windows 10: Electrical Ceiling Specialties 11. Communications 3: 12. Lighting Millwork 8. Misc 1 Finish base trim · Finish light lens covers Ladder scuffs and marks on tiles at floor .05 BSB Clean dust off walls Main Terminal Office (managers office) item code description responsible complete Finish floor outlet boxes Touch up scuff marks on wall paint .02 .03 Clean multions typical all areas BBB Caulk repair at comers of walls BSB Flight-line Vestibule Restroom item code Description responsible complete .01 Finish base Caulk top of base to wall and paint .02 BSB Hallway responsible complete item code description

.01 4 Putty nail holes with color match

SHAWNEE SIRPORT TERMINAL ARCHITECTS PROJECT # 2008

Shawnee, Oklahoma

Duane D Mass AIA
June 1, 2011, will be the effective date of warranty beginning

2. V				9.	Mechanical
-2. V	Valis (NSEW)	6,	Windows	10.	Electrical
3. C	eiling	7.	Specialties	11.	Communications
-4 M	lillwork	8.	Misc	12.	Lighting

Mezzanine

item	code	description	resp	on	sible	comple	te
.01	1	Finish cleaning stairs and check vinyl stair covers for adhesion	B	Ś	в	-	
.02	4	Clean rail and clean mullions	13	ż	В	V	» 3
.03	2	Caulk GWB to aluminum rail and paint	(P)	ŝ	B	-	-
.04	4	Close off upper wood trim at corner with metal or wood	13	ś	B	-	4
.05	4	Touch oak and putty nail holes with color match	13	3	В	ν	-

Storage-Pilots Lounge-Toilet at Pilots Lounge-Janitor-Flight Planning

item	code	description	resp	100	ısible	complete	
.01	2	Storage Room - Touch up ceiling paint 2 places	B	ż	В		
.02	8	Pilots lounge - Finish cleaning and touch up paint 2 locations and re-clean glass	3	š	В	~ ·	
.03	8	Toilet at Pilots Lounge – finish cleaning and caulk off base to wall at tile trim	8	è	В	L	
.04	8	Janitor-Finish cleaning, touch up walls at smeared dirt, finish ceiling and replace tiles.	3	4	B	~	×
						200	20

punch list.

FINAL ACCEPTANCE NOTICE

	Date:	July 15, 2011
	Project Number:	SNL-10-S
	Airport:	Shawnee Regional
TO:	Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1244 W Oklahoma City OK 73102 (405) 604-6900 – phone (405) 604-6919 – fax	
FROM:	Rex Hennen Assistant Airport Manager P.O. Box 1448 Address Shawnee 74802 ChyTown and Zip Code 405-878-1625 Area Code and Phone Number	
This is to adv	rise you that the exceptions found at	the final inspection have been
completed or	corrected. The project is accepted to	Oy Rex Hennen (Assistant Airport Manager)
on July 15, 2 (Dale)	2011 at <u>St</u>	nawnee Regional (Location)
Signature of above		55157 HWT: AIRPORT MAYAS SR Title of above named person

NOTE:

of the Project.

If no exceptions are found at the Final Inspection, submit this form at the same time the Final Inspection is completed, showing acceptance



OFFICE OF THE STATE AUDITOR & INSPECTOR 2300 N. LINCOLN BOULEVARD, ROOM 100 OKLAHOMA CITY, OK 73105-4896

WWW.SAI.OK.GOV